Health Versus Economy: Lockdown Controversy Coverage in Indonesian Online News Platforms

Ardhanareswari Avianti Handoko

Ultimacomm publishes research articles and conceptual paper in the field of communication, mainly digital journalism and strategic communication. It is published twice a year by the Faculty of Communication of Universitas Multimedia Nusantara

Submit your article to this journal

Published in Partnership with

APJIKI
ASOSIASI PENERBIT JURNAL ILMU KOMUNIKASI INDONESIA

Health Versus Economy: Lockdown Controversy Coverage in Indonesian Online News Platforms

Ardhanareswari Avianti Handoko

Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Indonesia

Email: ardhanareswari@ui.ac.id

Abstrak

Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic has urged several countries to take an extreme measurement by imposing a lockdown policy to control the spread of the virus. Generally approved, the action might have several negative effects, primarily on economic aspects. Utilizing qualitative framing analysis, the study investigates how three national online economic and business media platforms, namely Kontan.co.id, Bisnis.com, and CNBCIndonesia.com, apply news frames to cater the lockdown-related issues to the public. The study identified four news frames: conflict, attribution of responsibility, economic consequences, and human interest. It appears that the 'conflict frame' is heavily used to portray lockdown policy as an 'arena of war' between health and economic interest.

Keywords: COVID-19 Impacts, Economic and Business Media, Lockdown, Qualitative Framing Analysis

INTRODUCTION

Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) was first reported in Wuhan, China, around the last quarter of 2019. In a relatively short period, the virus has spread rapidly throughout the globe. The scale of the outbreak urged several governments to impose strict lockdown in order to flatten the curve of the case. At the end of March 2020, at least more than 100 countries applied the lockdown approach (Illmer et al., 2021). Despite the apparent popularity of the policy, the lockdown measurement had sparked disputes. The debates was also depicted in the media coverage on the lockdown-related issues (Hubner, 2021; Zhang, 2021).

In the event of an emergency, as such is the case with the pandemic outbreak, media indeed play a monumental role specifically in shaping the public understanding and reactions to the outbreak per se (Gantiva et al., 2021; Hubner, 2021; Jo & Chang, 2020; Ogbodo et al., 2020; Ophir, 2018; Ophir et al., 2021). News framing is implied to portray the issues around the pandemic to accentuate a specific side of the story and lead public opinion in a certain direction

accordingly (Entmant, 1993 in Linström & Marais, 2012). Hypothetically, this is also the case in lockdown-related issues.

The media's debate about lockdown was primarily on its side effects on economic and societal aspects (Singer & Plant, 2020; Zhang, 2021). The lockdown was presented as a dilemma between health and other important aspects of the public. As such is the case in Indonesia, the government was pressured to impose lockdown as a measurement to tackle the rapid spread of the outbreak (Tim Detikcom, 2020). During the mid to the end of March 2020, the lockdown-themed information dominated the news. Public discussion centred on how bad the economic fall down would have been if the government had decided to imply lockdown. Others were concerned about the risk of worsening outbreaks if the strict measurement was not taken into account. Institute for Development of Economics and Finance (INDEF), for instance, claimed that 68% of their respondents agree to lockdown (Bangsa, 2020), while CNN Indonesia pointed out that only 35,5% of the respondents are pro-lockdown (CNN Indonesia, 2020)

Meanwhile, the framing analysis studies on coronavirus coverage have been, indeed, flourishing. Several studies analyze how international news organizations framed the COVID-19 issues during the initial stage of the outbreak (Mutua & Ong'ong'a, 2020; Ogbodo et al., 2020), while others focused on a particular country such as Nigeria (Nwakpu et al., 2020), Canada (Poirier et al., 2020), Italy (Ophir et al., 2021), Columbia (Gantiva et al., 2021), China (Zhang, 2021), and Korea (Jo & Chang, 2020). Scholars also carried several specific research on lockdown issues. Most of the research in this area are comparative, such as Zhang (2021). Zhang's study investigates how *The New York Times* depicts the lockdown-related issues in Wuhan and Italy. Jo & Chang (2020) explore how the national media present South Korean quarantine policy and compare it with similar policies in other countries. The majority of the studies also mention the media practice of contrasting health and economic in COVID-19 news framing (Gantiva et al., 2021; Hubner, 2021; Poirier et al., 2020).

In Indonesia, numerous research on COVID-19 framing analysis has also been carried out. A relatively huge number of investigations focus on how the government tackles this health crisis in general (Azmi Sitorus & Firdaus Rahmadi, 2021; Permata, 2020; Sofian & Lestari, 2021; Sofyan, 2021). Several studies highlight particular policies for a specific area, such as manpower and labour policy (Palupi & Irawan, 2020), corruption themed-news related to the COVID-19 outbreak (Anzari & Fariza, 2021; Yusniar & Retnasary, 2020; Launa & Lusinawati, 2021), and youth dealing with the pandemic (Boer et al., 2020). However, it came to my knowledge that framing analysis on lockdown-related issues in Indonesia has not been explored yet.

In order to fill the gap, this study aims to add the covid-19 framing analysis based-research. Thus, this research focuses on how the frame is *implied* in news coverage. In addition, this article also proposes a new perspective by reviewing the news coverage in business and economic media. The business and economy media selection was also based on the lack of exposure in this specified area. A relatively small amount of framing analysis research has been focused on this cluster. The majority of the study is still centralized in the general mainstream media outlet such as *Tempo* (Sofian & Lestari, 2021)*, Kompas.com* (Boer et al., 2020; Palupi & Irawan, 2020; Hayati & Yoedtadi, 2020), *Tribunnews.com* (Hayati & Yoedtadi, 2020)*, Detik.com* (Permata, 2020), *Liputan6.com* (Boer et al., 2020), *CNN Indonesia.com* (Boer et al., 2020; Naqqiyah, 2020), and *Tirto.id* (Naqqiyah, 2020).

On further consideration, the tendency of media organizations to contrast health and economic aspects (Gantiva et al., 2021; Hubner, 2021; Poirier et al., 2020) also propel the curiosity on how the business and economy media portray the COVID-19 outbreak, specifically in the sensitive issue such as lockdown policy. Hypothetically, the media might use the appropriate news frames to depict the lockdown controversy as a dilemmatic decision between health and the economy. The study reviews articles featured in three online businesses and economy media platforms, namely *Kontan.co.id, CNBCIndonesia.com,* and *Bisnis.com,* to answer the two following questions:
1. What frame(s) do the online business and economy media cover Indonesia lockdown polemic-related issues?
2. What is the editorial standpoint of each business and economy media on the lockdown issue in Indonesia?

This study uses two main concepts as theoretical approaches; 'news framing' and 'news.' Those two concepts are relatively close. Together they establish the key notion of the research where the assumption of frame-based constructed news manages to direct how people see and make sense of reality. In doing so, the media drives the public opinion of an issue, an event, or other news objects.

News Framing in Epidemic Outbreak

The majority of the scholars define 'framing' from its functional point of view. In that sense, framing is a way to direct the public on seeing and judging an issue or an event (Jasperson *et al.*, 1998 in Linström & Marais, 2012). This particular function is also valid during a crisis, as such is the case with disease outbreaks. Framing, specifically in the news, plays a pivotal role. Gislason (2013) concludes that the news frames used by the news outlets during a public health emergency

heavily influence the process of how the societal understanding is constructed, which define the reactions to the outbreak accordingly.

The premise was proven in several related research. News media significant function is accentuated in Ebola, SARS, MERS, and now, Coronavirus (Mutua & Ong'ong'a, 2020). In the initial stage of the COVID-19 outbreak, four news frames were heavily found in international news outlets coverage of the pandemic, namely 'economic consequences,' 'human interest,' 'attribution of responsibility,' and 'health severity' (Mutua & Ong'ong'a, 2020). The first three frames were developed by Semetko & Valkenburg (2000). Along with the three frames, long with the three frames, Semetko and Valkenburg (2000) also identified two other frames; 'conflict' and 'morality.'

They argue that the conflict frame is used to point out the conflict among individuals, groups, institutions, or states. Meanwhile, the human interest frame highlights an issue's human interest side by telling personal stories to accentuate the emotional dimension of a particular issue or event. Attribution of responsibility' aims to show the audiences who should take responsibility for the problem or the issue, whereas morality frame refers to the dimension of morality. Last, *the 'economic consequences frame' is* the main focus of the economic impact.

The same frameset was also identified in other framing analysis studies (Ogbodo et al., 2020). Ogbodo and his fellow researchers conclude from a quantitative approach that human interest, attribution of responsibility, and economic consequences were among the most popular frames used by global media outlets in reporting COVID-19 news. Zhang (2021) investigated lockdown-related issued reportage in *The New York Times.* It emerged that the lockdown policy was heavily politicized using human interest and conflict frames.

The majority of the research used generic frames as the conceptual approach. Due to the generic nature of the frames, it is easier to carry a comparative study and conduct a generalization accordingly (Linström and Marais, 2012). Although sometimes, the generic frames are not relevant for several issues.

Practically, it is also common to find several frames in the particular news. In doing so, the news could apply the dominant and secondary frames. The dominant frame is the main theme used to tell the story of an issue or an event to the audience. Meanwhile, the second frame is the supplementary thematic narration to support the main or dominant theme (Linström and Marais, 2012).

News as Mass Media Content

In a book entitled "Mediating the Message: Theories of Influences on Mass Media Content," (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996, p. 251) pointed out that news, as mass media content, is a product constructed through a social process. Shoemaker and Reese proposed five-level of interfering factors in the construction of news; individual level (journalist's background), media routine level (chain of news production daily), media organization level (company structure), extra media level (external), and ideology level.

METHODS

This study adopted the qualitative framing analysis method (Linström & Marais, 2012) to generate an in-depth understanding of how media served a particular issue or event to the public. The method of qualitative framing analysis by systematically close reading is deemed adequate to reveal all elements within the text (Teutsch & Niemann, 2016), both implicit and explicit.

This article investigated three business and economic online media platforms published in Bahasa Indonesia, namely *Kontan.co.id, CNBCIndonesia.com,* dan *Bisnis.com*. Those three media have secured their places in the 50 top sites based on Alexa rank in Indonesia. As of early April 2021, *Kontan* is 27th, *CNBCIndonesia.com* is 28th, and *Bisnis.com* is 49th. Besides, they have a similar target audience. Based on Alexa data (Alexa, 2021), the three platforms have audience overlap scores of 70%. This means the users visiting all three sites most likely come from the same or similar groups and apply similar keywords.

The time spans for this particular study were from March 15th to 31st, 2020. This specified timeline was determined by data derived from Google Trends, which shows the keywords' trend fluctuation used in the search engine. According to the data from Google Trends, the keywords 'lockdown Indonesia' reached a peak within that time. The highest peaks appeared multiple times along March 15th-April 4th, 2020. However, the government ended the polemic upon lockdown decision by announcing a restriction scheme, 'Pembatasan Sosial Berskala Besar (PSBB)' on March 31st, 2020. Therefore, the date marked the end of the data collection.

The study used news articles published on the three media platforms from March 15th to 31st, 2020. The articles were collected through the search menu on each site using 'lockdown Indonesia' and 'karantina wilayah Indonesia' as the keywords. The articles with unrelated content to the situation in Indonesia were

excluded. Out of all the lockdown articles collected in each media, 75% were picked. The articles were randomly chosen to represent every date between the specified time. At the end of the process, there were 101 samples; *Kontan.co.id* (11 articles), *CNBCIndonesia.com* (43 articles), and *Bisnis.com* (47 articles).

The articles were analyzed using technical and rhetorical devices in order to identify the frame approach in each article. In doing so, the articles were investigated based on several elements such as headline, subheading, sources, and quotation. Consecutively, the samples are analyzed using the rhetorical device. This device includes diction, metaphor, exemplar, keyword, and concluding. A similar method strategic was also used in Mutua and Ong'ong'a (2020) and Perkins (2005).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Lockdown News Framing in Indonesia

At least four news frames dominate the news; *conflict, attribution of responsibility, economic consequences,* and *human interest.* In the next part of this article, the application of each frame will be discussed thoroughly.

1. *Conflict*

In all three news outlets, the conflict frame becomes the most dominant frame in news coverage of lockdown (Zhang, 2021). The frame is used to highlight several clashes that occurred. This study identified five conflict topics: *health vs economy, central government vs local government, Indonesian policy vs other countries' policy, Indonesian government vs international organization, and lockdown vs no lockdown*.

Health vs Economy

The conflict frame was mainly applied to protrude the dilemma between health and economy. The three news outlets presented the pre-lockdown as a dilemmatic situation. In that sense, the government should choose health over the economy or vice versa. To strengthen the conflict narration between economy and health, the media also used the economic consequences as the secondary frame. This particular frame was implied to highlight the economic side effects once the lockdown was imposed.

The narration structure was built by the technical and rhetorical elements. The headline was found to be the focal point and is deemed to be the most prominent technical tool (Pan and Kosicki, 1993 in Linström & Marais, 2012). Thus, the news title becomes a powerful clue to identify how the media represent an issue and, in many cases, reflect the editorial position on a particular issue.

Table 1. Keywords in Conflict Frame

Media	English (Translated)	Bahasa (Original)
CNBCIndonesia.com, 17/3/2020	Under corona **lockdown**, **growth** may shrink down to -4%!	Ramai **Lockdown** Karena Corona, **Pertumbuhan Ekonomi** Bisa **-4**%!
Bisnis.com, 18/3/2020	CSIS: 2 weeks **lockdown** may cut growth by 0,5 percent	CSIS: **Lockdown** 2 Minggu **Ekonomi** Bisa **Susut** 0,5 Persen
Kontan.co.id, 17/3/2020	Economist: Indonesian **economy** to face **death** if **lockdown** imposed	Ekonom: Jika **Lockdown** Diterapkan **Perekonomian** Indonesia Bakal **Mati**

Source: Data analysis

The headlines in the table contain keywords 'lockdown' and 'economy.' Furthermore, other keywords such as 'minus (-),' 'decrease,' and 'die' were also included in the headlines. These words were used to construct a negative relationship between lockdown and the economy in Indonesia. By doing so, the media led the audiences to see the reality construct where lockdown and economy would switch one another off (Singer & Plant, 2020). The conflict relation construct between health and economy was also protruded by the selection of quotations from news sources. Below is the sample of direct quotes found in the news:

Table 2. Quote Selection

Media	Language	Quotation
Kontan.co.id 17/3/2020	English (translated)	"The anticipation plan should also be considered if the **lockdown** is going to be imposed. The impact is definitely **significant**. The **economy** would be **switched off**." -- Economist from Center of Reform on Economics Indonesia Pieter Abdullah.
	Bahasa (original)	"Termasuk juga merencanakan antisipasi apabila dilakukan *lockdown* dampaknya bisa dipastikan akan **signifikan, perekonomian** seperti **dimatikan**. Semua ini harus diantisipasi dan disiapkan solusinya."
CNBCIndonesia.com, 18/3/2020	English (translated)	"But if **it is so** (**lockdown is imposed**), the impact towards the **economy** would be **extremely huge**. We have to prepare if we want to get there. Mainly how the impact on the food logistic, health, and also the people in informal sector."--Economist Bank Central Asia David Sumual.
	Bahasa (original)	"Tapi kalau seperti **itu (***lockdown***)** kan, dampak ke **ekonominya besar sekali**. Kita harusnya ada persiapan dulu kalau ke arah sana. Sejauh ini, terutama soal logistik pangan, kesehatan terus juga yang terdampak masalah-masalah masyarakat yang sektor informal itu."
Kontan.co.id, 17/3/2020	English (translated)	"The **economic impact** could be fixed **as we get along** and the **virus is eliminated**, but if the **virus is not being taken care of** then the people would also **scared to be involve in activity**."-- Indonesian Employers Association (Apindo) Hariyadi Sukamdani.
	Bahasa (original)	"Kalau masalah **dampak ekonominya** nanti **bisa sambil berjalan** apabila **virusnya tereliminir**, tapi jika **virus tidak teratasi** maka masyarakat juga **tidak berani** untuk beraktivitas."

Source: Data analysis

The presence of the direct quote from professionally competent sources also strengthened the narration. At least, there are two levels of public understanding that the media want to pursue. *First,* to create the perception of whether locking

down an economy is a conflicting matter. *Second*, to determine the public's attitude and choice on the issue; to lockdown or not? Economy or health?

Central Government Versus Local Government

Within this particular issue of lockdown dilemma, the conflict frame was also used to highlight the clash between the local government and central government in Indonesia. In this topic group, the narration was focused on the asynchronous policy between the central and local governments in tackling the pandemic. Several local governments decided to imply local lockdown. On the other hand, the central government emphasized that the decision whether to impose lockdown or not, both locally and nationally, was the domain authority of the central government. The highlight of conflict between these two parties is reflected in the news's technical and rhetorical devices.

Table 4. Figures in Headlines

Media	Language	Headline
CNBCIndonesia.com, 16/3/2020	English (translated)	To **Anies** and **Emil**, **Jokowi**: Regions are not allowed lockdown.
	Bahasa (original)	Untuk **Anies** Hingga **Emil, Jokowi**: Daerah **Tak Boleh** Lockdown.

Source: Data analysis

The names in the headline above refer to the well-known governors. Both Anies Baswedan (Governor of DKI Jakarta) and Ridwan Kamil (Governor of West Java) have prominent news value. The headlines also include an indirect quotation from President Joko Widodo, which said that the regions could not take their own decision upon the lockdown matter. Further, it explicitly shows the clash among the parties. The use of imperative sentences in Jokowi's quotation also symbolizes the president's superior position over the two governors. Therefore, the governors must have obeyed the president.

Table 5. Jokowi's Quotation

Media	Language	Quote
Kontan.co.id, 19/3/2020	English (translated)	"The **lockdow**n policy, both at the **national and regional** level, is **central government's** policy."--President Joko Widodo
		"This policy **could not be decided** by the local government, and we **do not think to take the lockdown** policy into account."--President Joko Widodo
	Bahasa (original)	"Kebijakan *lockdown*, baik di tingkat **nasional** dan tingkat **daerah**, adalah kebijakan pemerintah **pusat**."
		"Kebijakan ini **tak boleh diambil** oleh **pemda**, dan **tak ada kita berpikiran untuk kebijakan** *lockdown*."

Source: Kontan.co.id

National Versus International Policy

This study identifies that the frame was used to contrast the current national situation with the condition abroad, specifically the countries where the lockdown was adopted.

Table 6. Headline Analysis

Media	Language	Headline
Bisnis.com, 16/3/2020	English (translated)	Malaysia imposes national lockdown, when will Indonesia?
	Bahasa (original)	Malaysia Putuskan Lockdown Nasional, Indonesia Kapan?

Source: *Bisnis.com*

The headline justifies the comparison between the Malaysian and Indonesian policies. By inserting the question 'when,' the news aims to convey the message that Indonesia is already behind Malaysia. This headline sentence also puts pressure on the government to accelerate the decision-making process upon the lockdown issue. Besides the diction, the exemplar is implied as well to provide examples of several countries which have decided to apply the lockdown measurement, such as the Philippines, Vietnam, and China. The exemplars, in this case, emphasize the contrast between national and international policy.

Table 6. Achmad Yurianto Quotes

Media	Language	Quote
Bisnis.com, 16/3/2020	English (translated)	"Does **lockdown solve the problem** or **create a new problem**, instead? We have to be really careful **not just follow** others."--Covid Task Force, Achmad Yurianto.
	Bahasa (original)	"Apakah dengan lockdown menyelesaikan masalah atau malah bikin masalah baru. Kita harus hati-hati betul dengan ini, kita enggak latah-latahan kok ya," Satgas Covid, Achmad Yurianto

Source: *Bisnis.com*

The direct quote from Achmad Yurianto shows the task force's point of view that lockdown may generate a new problem instead of fixing the problem. This is, indeed, in contradiction with the advice from WHO.

2. *Attribution of Responsibility*

Attribution of responsibility frames also dominated the news coverage on COVID-19 (Mutua & Ong'ong'a, 2020; Ogbodo et al., 2020). It further emerged that the particular frame was also heavily used in lockdown polemic issues (Zhang, 2021). In order to accentuate the responsibility theme in the narration, direct and indirect quotations from prominent sources were also implied. The majority of the samples urge the government to make a significant decision as a form of responsibility to tackle the outbreak.

Table 7. Figures in Framing

Language	Headline
English (translated)	1. The board of **FKUI professors** on corona: from **local lockdown** to expert involvement (*Bisnis.com,* 27/3/2020)
	2. **MUI requires** the government to impose **total lockdown** immediately (*Bisnis.com,* 29/3/2020)
	3. **PPP**: the government could take **lockdown** option (*Bisnis.com,* 29/3/2020)
	4. **Ilham Habibie** ask the government to **lockdown Jakarta** immediately (*Bisnis.com,* 29/3/2020)
	5. **Jusuf Kalla**: **Lockdown is needed** if we do not want to be the next Iran, Korea, Italia (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 15/3/2020)
	6. **Jusuf Kalla** once urged the government to impose lockdown, now it is up **to Jokowi** (*CNBCIndonesia.com*, 17/3/2020)
	7. To prevent corona, **Sandiaga** supports **partial lockdown** (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 26/3/2020)
	8. **Mr Jokowi**, Indonesia covid-19 **death ratio** is the 4th worst in the world

	(*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 15/3/2020)
	9. **Mr Jokowi**, **please listen** to the 7 recommendations from these doctors (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 27/3/2020)
	10. **Jokowi** is not considering lockdown, **do not be late** to make a decision, Sir! (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 18/3/2020)
Bahasa (original)	1. **Imbauan Dewan Guru Besar FKUI** Soal Corona: Dari **Lokal *Lockdown*** Hingga Keterlibatan Ahli 2. **MUI Minta** Pemerintah **Segera *Lockdown*** Total 3. **PPP Menilai** Pemerintah **Bisa Mengambil** Opsi **Karantina Wilayah** 4. **Ilham Habibie** Minta Pemerintah **Segera Karantina** Jakarta 5. **JK**: **Perlu *Lockdown*** Jika Tak Ingin Seperti Iran, Korea, Italia 6. **JK** Sempat Dorong *Lockdown* Kini **Serahkan Keputusan** ke Jokowi 7. Cegah Corona, **Sandiaga Dukung Partial *Lockdown*** 8. Pak Jokowi, **Rasio Kematian** Covid 19 RI Terburuk Keempat di Dunia 9. Pak Jokowi **Tolong Dengar** 7 Rekomendasi dari Para Dokter Ini 10. **Jokowi** Tak Berpikir *Lockdown,* **Awas Telat** Ambil Keputusan Pak!

Source: Data analysis

Here, the study identifies that the sources are all well-known elites and powerful figures. Their speech is attached within the news as headlines and quotes to increase the credibility of the articles. Thus, the media intend to show that it is not the journalist urging the government to take a particular action. Instead, these figures demand responsibility from the stakeholders to save the people from the pandemic. The presence of a prominent and competent figure in the area of a particular issue may also be beneficial for the framing process.

It is important to note that the article's quote selection also plays a substantial role. In the headlines highlighting President Joko Widodo as the decision-maker (see table 7), there are several phrases such as 'please listen' and 'watch out for being late.' Those phrases signify the urgency of a specific policy to deal with the pandemic. In this case, 'Mr. Jokowi' is the strong symbol representing the executive institution authorized to make the decision. Generally, the media also use the strong words; 'should,' 'immediately,' 'urgent,' 'could,' 'need' in the sentences to corroborate the government's responsibility to impose the right policy.

Another point worthy of attention is the choice of news source in this health crisis-related issues. The majority of the sources cited in the articles are dominated by economists, business people, and other figures with qualified business and economic backgrounds. Meanwhile, the sources with health and scientific backgrounds are rare, even in the articles underlining the conflict

between health and economy. Zhang (2021) also found identical findings, the lockdown-related news in *The New York Times* was heavily politicized and, therefore, marginalized the health and scientific elements of the story. Instead of presenting comprehensive information by discussing the aspects of the outbreak, the journalists tend to omit other information outside the frame theme they use in a particular article (Ophir, 2018).

3. *Economic Consequences*

This study identified that in the lockdown polemic coverage, the economic consequences frame was primarily used as the secondary frame. There are at least three groups of news underlining the loss and profit side of the story. The first is the newsgroup related to the lockdown polemic and the fluctuation of investment instruments, mainly the stock market and foreign exchange. *Second,* the newsgroup covers the real sectors such as industry and logistics. *Third,* the news covers macroeconomic matters.

Table 8. Headlines on Economy Issues

Group	Language	Headline
Investment	English (translated)	1. If the l**ockdown** to be imposed, here is the impact on **the stock market**. (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 30/3/2020) 2. The impact of lockdown scenario for the insurance industry (*Bisnis.com,* 30/3/2020)
	Bahasa (original)	1. Jika **Karantina Wilayah** Berlaku, Ini Dampaknya ke **Pasar Saham** 2. Dampak Skenario *Lockdown* bagi Industri **Asuransi**
Real sector	English (translated)	1. This is what **logistic** businessmen say on the **lockdow**n issue (*Kontan.co.id,* 29/3/2020)
	Bahasa (original)	1. Ini Kata Pengusaha **Logistik** Soal Wacana **Karantina Wilayah**
Macro economy	English (translated)	1. **Corona pandemic**, Indonesia **export** to China **drops**! (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 16/3/2020) 2. **Ouch**! This is the **worst s**cenario **covid** may have **on economy** (*Bisnis.com,* 20/3/2020)
	Bahasa (original)	1. Wabah **Corona, Ekspor** RI ke China **Anjlok!** 2. **Aduh**! Ini Skenario T**erburuk Covid**-19 Terhadap **Ekonomi**

Source: Data analysis

In order to build the theme of the economic consequences, keywords were heavily used. In this particular case, the keywords include economic terms, 'stock,' export,' and 'market' (see table 8). The keywords were also supported by the quantitative data put into the narration. Furthermore, most of the sources cited were economists, stock market and financial analysts, industrial associations, and related stakeholders such as the ministry of finance, the ministry of trade, and the statistical bureau. Thus, the sources have qualified expertise, which increases the credibility and validity of the message (Linström & Marais, 2012).

4. *Human Interest*

The human interest frame was used the least to cover the issue compared to other frames discussed previously. The study also found that the human interest theme was not used solely. The secondary frame supported the frame, mainly economic consequences, specifically stories about the struggle of vulnerable groups and how the lockdown policy may cost their lives. It is important to note that the presence of these vulnerable groups in three of the media is relatively rare.

Table 9. Human Interest Frame

Object	Language	Quote
Online drivers	English (translated)	Corona pandemic, **online drivers refuse lockdown** policy in Jakarta (*Bisnis.com,* 18/3/2020)
	Bahasa (original)	Pandemi Corona, **Driver Ojol Tolak** Opsi Jakarta **Lockdown**
Labourers	English (translated)	Thousands of labourers may be **laid off** due to corona (*CNBCIndonesia.com,* 26/3/2020)
	Bahasa (original)	Deg-degan, Corona Bisa Makan Korban **Ratusan Ribu PHK**
Migrant workers	English (translated)	Malaysian **lockdown**, what about the **migrant workers** from Indonesia? (*Bisnis.com,* 17/3/2020)
	Bahasa (original)	Malaysia **Lockdown**, Bagaimana Nasib **Pekerja Migran** Indonesia?

Source: Data analysis

Editorial Standpoint on Lockdown Issue

There are various influential factors on how the media convey an issue or an event to the public. One of the main factors is the ideology of each organization which then manifests in many aspects, including the editorial policy (Castilla et al., 2013). Undoubtedly, the premise is also valid in health crisis coverage. Journalists do not simply cater the information to the public. In fact, they tailor it based on their needs and routines (Ophir, 2018). As such is the case with the lockdown-related reportage, *Kontan.co.id, Bisnis.com,* and *CNBCIndonesia.com* articulated their editorial position, both explicitly and implicitly in the news they produced.

Table 10. Editorial Standpoint

Language	*Kontan.co.id* Contra-lockdown	*Bisnis.com* Pro-lockdown	*CNBCIndonesia.com* Neutral
English (translated)	Economist: If **lockdown** is imposed, the Indonesian **economy** will **die**	**Local quarantine** immediately to end the corona chain	**Lockdown** or not, here are the **pros and cons**
Bahasa (original)	Ekonom: Jika *Lockdown* Diterapkan **Perekonomian** Indonesia Bakal **Mati**	Memutus Mata Rantai Corona, **Karantina** Lokal **Sekarang**	*Lockdown* Enggak, *Lockdown* Enggak, Simak Dulu **Plus Minusnya**
English (translated)	The Pandemic outbreak, Luhut claims **lockdown is unnecessary** in Indonesia	Social restriction optimization: **do not be afraid of lockdown**	Do we need lockdown? Check how **scary** if Jokowi imposes **lockdown**
Bahasa (original)	Wabah Corona Merebak, Luhut Tegaskan Indonesia **Tak Perlu *Lockdown***	Optimalisasi Pembatasan Sosial, **Jangan Takut *Lockdown***	Perlu Enggak Sih? Ini **Ngerinya** Jika Jokowi Putuskan *Lockdown*
English (translated)			Lockdown is **inevitable** in Indonesia, how far is the preparation?
Bahasa (original)			*Lockdown* Jadi **Keniscayaan** di RI, Bagaimana Persiapannya?

Source: Data analysis

The headlines samples (Table 10) reflect the editorial slant of each media. Editorial slant is defined as the tone uttered by the news as influenced by the editorial position (Druckman & Parkin, 2005). It shows that *Kontan.co.id* was on the opposing side on the lockdown issue, whereas *Bisnis.com* explicitly expressed its support to the policy. Meanwhile, *CNBCIndonesia.com* were more neutral compared to the others. In *CNBCIndonesia.com,* both the tones, pro, and contra, were presented in the reporting. Interestingly, there seemed to be a shift in the *CNBCIndonesia.com* editorial position. When the polemic first occurred, the news in *CNBCIndonesia.com* tended to be anti-lockdown, although it did not state clearly its position. Yet, the editorial standpoint of *CNBCIndonesia.com* changed, as reflected in the last headline in the table (see table 10).

Therefore, the shifting positioning of the media is also mirrored in the editorial slant (Druckman & Parkin, 2005). At the same time, it confirms that the editorial position creeps into the reportage to shape how the public sees the issue (Druckman & Parkin, 2005). The fact that editorial writing (including opinion articles) has a relatively low reading rate (Gil González, 2007 in Blanco Castilla et al., 2013) has made it more important to infiltrate the news with the editorial standpoint.

This practice is undoubtedly related to the concept of media bias. D'Alessio and Allen (2000) identified three types of bias; 'gatekeeping bias,' 'coverage bias,' and 'statement bias.' In this case, the media heavily played the coverage and statement bias. In doing so, the news outlets accentuate one side of the story while omitting another to ensure that the side being consumed by the public is their favoured side (D'Alessio & Allen, 2000).

The news sources' statement was also selected carefully to support the editorial stance. Although journalists interview the same source on the same occasion, they may use different quotations from that particular source. The selection is based on the agenda of each organization (table 11 and 12).

Table 11. Same Source, Different Angle

	Language	*Kontan.co.id*	*Bisnis.com*
Luhut Binsar Pandjaitan as the main source of the news	English (translated)	Coordinating Minister Luhut: Certainty on lockdown, to be decided this week	Luhut to propose local quarantine to Jokowi this afternoon
	Bahasa (original)	Menko Luhut: Kepastian Karantina Wilayah Diputuskan Pekan Ini	Luhut Usul Karantina Wilayah Kepada Jokowi Siang Ini

Source: Data analysis

Table 12. Same Source, Different Quote

	Language	*Kontan.co.id*	*Bisnis.com*
Quote selection from the same source (Shinta Kamdani)	English (translated)	"We do not know whether Indonesia may grow 1-2% if the lockdown is imposed in Jakarta since the economy in Indonesia is too centralized in Jakarta."	"How we handle the virus is important so that the virus does not spread widely."
	Bahasa (original)	"Kita tidak tahu apakah Indonesia bisa memiliki pertumbuhan 1-2% bila karantina terhadap Jakarta dilakukan karena ekonomi Indonesia secara keseluruhan terlalu tersentral di Jakarta."	"Yang penting penanggulangannya (virus) dulu biar tidak menyebar luas." (Shinta Kamdani, Apindo)

Source: Data analysis

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the business and economy online media imply several frames in covering the lockdown polemic issue in Indonesia. This research identifies four frames; *conflict, attribution of responsibility, economic consequences,* and *human interest.* Based on the analysis, the most used frame is the conflict frame. Using this frame, the media aims to signify the clash between health and the economy. The media have constructed a narrative in which the government is facing a dilemmatic choice; health over the economy or vice versa.

The frames found throughout this study confirm that the selection of the frames by the national media is similar to the frames used by the international media (Mutua & Ong'ong'a, 2020; Ogbodo et al., 2020; Zhang, 2021). This study concludes that news framing somehow leads to incomplete news articles. Consequently, instead of telling the comprehensive story to the public, some information about the issue is omitted to accentuate the desired frame (Ophir, 2018). This partial information may trigger inappropriate perception, attitude, and behaviour in such a critical condition, costing public safety.

Another finding worthy of attention is that this health-related issue has been heavily politicized (Hubner, 2021; Zhang, 2021). It is reflected in the choice of news frame and the news source selection. Instead of the academics and public health experts, the sources quoted in the news are dominated by politicians, business people, and other groups of interest (Hubner, 2021). Of course, the selection of the source is also dependant on the agenda and which side of the story the media support. This tendency is well-articulated in the editorial standpoint of each media.

The pivotal role of the media in such an emergency situation should be used wisely and cautiously. More importantly, the media should build a well-informed public by catering comprehensive information so that the public may act appropriately in response to pandemic outbreaks. Finally, although the generic frames used in the study allow the result to be generalized, it is worth exploring the topic further using issue-specific frames to increase the frames' sensitivity and relevancy.

REFERENCE

Alexa.   (2021).   *Top   Sites   in   Indonesia*.   Alexa.
        https://www.alexa.com/topsites/countries/ID

Anzari, P. P., & Fariza, N. P. (2021). Analisis Framing Pemberitaan Penangkapan
        Juliari Batubara Dalam Korupsi Dana Bansos COVID-19 Pada Kompas.com.
        Jurnal   Kajian   Media,   *5*(1),   39–49.
        http://ejournal.unitomo.ac.id/index.php/ilkom/index

Azmi Sitorus, A., & Firdaus Rahmadi, M. (2021). Disinkronisasi Kebijakan
        Pemerintah Indonesia Dalam Penanganan Covid-19. *Jurnal Renaissance*,
        6(1), 721–732. http://www.ejournal-academia.org/index.php/renaissance

Bangsa, R. P. (2020, April 5). Kajian INDEF: Sebanyak 68 Persen Harapkan
        Lockdown.   *Gatra.Com*.   https://www.gatra.com/detail/news/474534/
        ekonomi/kajian-indef-sebanyak-68-persen-harapkan-lockdown

Blanco Castilla, E., Quesada, M., & Teruel Rodríguez, L. (2013). From Kyoto to Durban. Mass media editorial position about climate change. *Revista Latina de Comunicacion Social*, *68*, 420–435. https://doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2013-983en

Boer, K. M., Pratiwi, M. R., & Muna, N. (2020). Analisis Framing Pemberitaan Generasi Milenial dan Pemerintah Terkait Covid-19 di Media Online. *Communicatus: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, *4*(1), 85–104. https://doi.org/10.15575/cjik.v4i1.8277

CNN Indonesia. (2020, May 20). Survei: 51,4 Persen Setuju PSBB, 35,5 Persen Ingin Lockdown. *CNN Indonesia*. https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20200519191958-20-505048/survei-514-persen-setuju-psbb-355-persen-ingin-lockdown

D'Alessio, D., & Allen, M. (2000). *Media Bias in Presidential Elections: A Meta-Analysis. Journal of Communication, 50(4), 133–156.* doi:10.1111/j.1460-2466.2000.tb02866.x

Druckman, J. N., & Parkin, M. (2005). The Impact of Media Bias: How Editorial Slant Affects Voters. *The Journal of Politics*, *67*(4), 1030–1049. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2508.2005.00349.x

Gantiva, C., Jiménez-Leal, W., & Urriago-Rayo, J. (2021). Framing Messages to Deal With the COVID-19 Crisis: The Role of Loss/Gain Frames and Content. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *12*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.568212

Gislason, M. K. (2013). West Nile Virus: The Production of a Public Health Pandemic. *Sociological Health Illness*, *35*(2), 188–199. DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-9566.2012.01535.x

Hayati, H. N., & Yoedtadi, M. G. (2020). Konstruksi Berita Covid-19 di Kompas.com dan Tribunnews.com. *Koneksi*, *4*(2), 243–250. Doi: 10.24912/kn.v4i2.8114

Hubner, A. (2021). How did we get here? A framing and source analysis of early COVID-19 media coverage. *Communication Research Reports*, *38*(2), 112–120. https://doi.org/10.1080/08824096.2021.1894112

Illmer, A., Wang, Y., & Wong, T. (2021, January 22). Wuhan Lockdown: A Year of China's Fight Against the Covid Pandemic. *BBC*. https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-china-55628488

Jo, W., & Chang, D. (2020). Political Consequences of COVID-19 and Media Framing in South Korea. *Frontiers in Public Health*, *8*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpubh.2020.00425

Launa, & Lusinawati, H. (2021). Potensi Korupsi Dana Bansos di Masa Pandemi COVID-19. *Majalah Semi Ilmiah Populer Komunikasi Massa*, *2*(1), 1–22. https://jurnal.kominfo.go.id/index.php/mkm/article/view/4095

Linström, M., & Marais, W. (2012). Qualitative News Frame Analysis: A Methodology. *Communitas*, *17*, 21–38.

Mutua, S. N., & Ong'ong'a, D. O. (2020). Online News Media Framing of COVID-19 Pandemic: Probing the Initial Phases of the Disease Outbreak in International Media. *European Journal of Interactive Multimedia and Education*, *1*(2). https://doi.org/10.30935/ejimed/8402

Naqqiyah, M. S. (2020). Analisis Framing Pemberitaan Media Online CNN Indonesia.com dan Tirto.id Mengenai Kasus Pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Kopis: Kajian Penelitian Dan Pemikiran Komunikasi Penyiaran Islam*, *3*(01), 18–27. https://doi.org/10.33367/kpi.v3i01.1483

Nwakpu, E. S., Ezema, V. O., & Ogbodo, J. N. (2020). Nigeria media framing of coronavirus pandemic and audience response. *Health Promotion Perspectives*, *10*(3), 192–199. https://doi.org/10.34172/hpp.2020.32

Ogbodo, J. N. et al. (2020). Communicating Health Crisis: A content analysis of global media framing of COVID-19. *Health Promotion Perspectives*, *10*(3), 257–269. https://doi.org/10.34172/hpp.2020.40

Ophir, Y. (2018). Coverage of Epidemics in American Newspapers Through the Lens of the Crisis and Emergency Risk Communication Framework. *Health Security*, *16*(3), 147–157. https://doi.org/10.1089/hs.2017.0106

Ophir, Y. et al. (2021). The Framing of COVID-19 in Italian Media and Its Relationship with Community Mobility: A Mixed-Method Approach. *Journal of Health Communication*, *26*(3), 161–173. https://doi.org/10.1080/10810730.2021.1899344

Palupi, M. F. T., & Irawan, R. E. (2020). Analisis Framing Pemberitaan Kebijakan Pemerintah Terkait Ketenagakerjaan sebagai Dampak Covid 19 di Kompas.com dan Malaysiakini. *Representamen*, *6*(02). https://doi.org/10.30996/representamen.v6i02.4262

Perkins, S. C. (2005). Un-presidented: A qualitative framing analysis of the NAACP's public relations response to the 2000 presidential election. *Public Relations Review*, *31*(1), 63–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2004.11.006

Poirier, W. et al. (2020). (Un)covering the Covid-19 pandemic: Framing analysis of the crisis in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Political Science*, *53*(2), 365–371. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0008423920000372

Semetko, H., & Valkenburg, P. M. (2000). Framing European Politics: A Content Analysis of Press and Television News. *Journal of Communication*, *50*(2), 93–109. doi: 10.1111/j.1460-2466.2000.tb02843.x

Permata, P. S. (2020). Framing Analysis on Public Crisis Communication by the Ministry of Health during COVID-19 Outbreak: *Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Social and Political Sciences (ICOSAPS 2020)*. 6th International Conference on Social and Political Sciences (ICOSAPS 2020), Surakarta, Jawa Tengah, Indonesia. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201219.017

Shoemaker, P. J., & Reese, S. D. (1996). *Mediating the message : theories of influences on mass media content*. New York: Longman.

Singer, P., & Plant, M. (2020, April 6). When Will The Pandemic Cure Be Worse Than The Disease. *Project Syndicate*. https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/when-will-lockdowns-be-worse-than-covid19-by-peter-singer-and-michael-plant-2020-04?barrier=accesspaylog

Sofian, A., & Lestari, N. (2021). Analisis framing pemberitaan tentang kebijakan pemerintah dalam menangani kasus Covid-19. *COMMICAST*, *2*(1), 58-70. https://doi.org/10.12928/commicast.v2i1.3150

Sofyan, F. S. (2021). *Respon Krisis Pemerintah Provinsi Bengkulu di Masa Pandemi COVID-19: Analisis Framing Terhadap Press Release Pemprov Bengkulu*. [Undergraduate Thesis, Universitas Islam Indonesia]. https://dspace.uii.ac.id/handle/123456789/33576

Teutsch, D., & Niemann, J. (2016). Social network sites as a threat to users' self-determination and security: A framing analysis of German newspapers. *Journal of International Communication*, *22*(1), 22–41. https://doi.org/10.1080/13216597.2015.1111841

Tim Detikcom. (2020, September 2). Timeline Setengah Tahun COVID-19 di Indonesia. *Detikcom*. https://news.detik.com/berita/d-5156199/timeline-setengah-tahun-covid-19-di-indonesia

Yusniar, E., & Retnasary, M. (2020). Analisis Framing Pemberitaan Menkumham Yasonna Laoly Tentang Kebijakan Pembebasan Narapidana Ditengah Wabah Covid-19: (Media Online detik.com dan kompas.com). *Jurnal Politikom Indonesiana*, *5*(2), 1–17. https://doi.org/10.35706/jpi.v5i2.3855

Zhang, R. (2021). How media politicize COVID-19 lockdowns: a case study comparing frame use in the coverage of Wuhan and Italy lockdowns by The New York Times. *Media Asia*, *48*(2), 89–107. https://doi.org/10.1080/01296612.2021.1884518