

---

# SATIRE IN THE MAKING RHETORICAL ANALYSIS OF HABIEB RIZIEQ MENJAWAB' FACEBOOK FAN PAGE

**Harry Febrian**

Faculty of Communication Science  
Universitas Multimedia Nusantara  
Email: [harryfebrian@umn.ac.id](mailto:harryfebrian@umn.ac.id)

## **Abstract**

Religious extremism is one of the major problems for Indonesia in the post-Soeharto era. The freedom that Indonesian people enjoyed after years of dictatorship by Soeharto also became a fertile ground for the idea of religious intolerances. Many effort are done by NGO's, government, and also religious institution to promote the moderate view to counter this intolerances. But with the rise of social media, Habieb Rizieq Menjawab (HRM) Facebook Fan page—with more than 70 thousand followers, making it one of the most followed for religious affiliated figure— which is a parody of one of the famous hardline religious organization with the same name, stands out, because it is arguably the first of its kind in Indonesian social media landscape (Lakshmi, 2012) With around 69 million active users in 2014 (Purnell, 2014), making it the fourth largest country with Facebook user in the world, it's hard to not look the important role this social media can play in Indonesia society. HRM becomes a unique and novel way for Indonesians to promote moderation and to counter the intolerances view.

Satire itself has a long a history as tools to voice a counter view. Goodall, H., Cheong, P., Fleischer, K., & Corman, S., (2012) show that this kind of communication has been used, for example, since the pre-Islamic Arab through Second World War. Most recent examples can be seen in the Middle East. Countries such Egypt and Syria, which have been known for their use of literature, art, and humor as tools of political protest, seen a more flourished and fertile ground for a more mature comedic art forms, such as the ever-present political cartoon (Leila, 2012).

This study will examine the usage of HRM Facebook Fan page, including status updates and image postings, seen with the perspective of critical theory of satire (Griffin, 1994) as a way to offer a counter-narrative, and an intervention to violent extremist narrative (Ashour, 2010) and Shetret (2011). The methodology to do it will be using the Rhetorical Analysis, with focus on Metaphorical Approach (Foss, 2009),

This study hopes to examine how satire and social media can become a tool to fight the spread of religious intolerant ideas. It is also hoped that this study can serve as a base for further study on this topic.

Keywords: Satire, Facebook, Rhetorical Analysis, Religious Intolerances, Counter Narrative

## **Introduction**

It is an arguably fact that religion plays an important role in Indonesia. It is easy to see how religion influences the daily life of Indonesian people. In the street, it is not hard to

spot someone with a religious attribute such as Jilbab. Even the constitution, known as Pancasila or Five Principles, puts the acknowledgments of God in as the first principle (Believe in the one Supreme God can be seen as the

most important and foundation for other four principles. According to a survey from Pew Research, Indonesia is in the first place out of 23 countries surveyed globally to acknowledge the importance of religion. 99% of the respondent says that religion is important for them, with 95% says that it is very important (Pew, 2008)

Indonesia are also well known as the largest Muslim country in the world. The latest government census available shows that in 2010, from total of 237 million citizens, 87 percent or 207 million of the population is a Muslim. Meanwhile, the rest is composed of 7 percent Protestant, 3 percent Roman Catholic, and 1.5 percent Hindu. The rest or around 1.25 percent is comprised of other religious groups, which include Buddhism, followers of traditional indigenous religions, Confucianism, other Christian denominations, and those who did not respond to the census question. (International Religious Freedom Report, 2012)

With the diversity in such huge scale, it's not a surprise to found several conflicts occurred in this vast archipelago. This happens especially after the dictatorial regime of Soeharto, which ruled Indonesia for 32 years ended. The freedom that emerges from what is known as Reformation Era in 1998 is also followed by the rise of some hard line religious organizations, such as Front Pembela Islam (FPI) and Majelis Mujahidin Indonesia (MMI). Some are already deemed as terrorist organizations and several of their members already put in jail because the involvement in terrorism and other criminal records.

Although the number of conflict is still very small compared to the number of population, the trend is showing an increase in religious conflict. For example, the newest report about religion conflict from non-governmental organization, which named after the late President of Indonesia Abdurrahman Wahid, Wahid Institute, indicated that there are as much as 278 cases of religious conflicts

in 2012, up more than 100% compared to the number in 2009, which only recorded around 121 cases (Wahid Institute, 2012). Similarly, the latest research from Setara Institute shows that in 2013, there are 222 acts of religious violation compared to 135 in 2007 (Setara Institute, 2013)

Interestingly, in Indonesia's cases of religious violence, one name keeps coming up: Front Pembela Islam (FPI) or Islamic Defenders Front. Its leader, Rizieq Shihab, was once sentenced 18 month in prison because the groups involvement in attacking an interfaith gathering in Jakarta, 2008. For safety reason, it took a thousand police to guard the court. Many controversies involving Rizieq Shihab makes him famous in many ways. To his supporters, he is a respectable religious figure—believed to be a descendant of Prophet Mohammad. Some people are planning to appoint him to become a presidential candidate (Hamluddin, 2013). For his opponent, Rizieq Shihab is the perfect personalization of the enemy of religious freedom (NU Online, 2008.). Rizieq Shihab is notorious for his aggressive speech, insulting many people including the president (Aquina & Yulika, 2013). There are not many who dare to criticize Rizieq in public, fearing that they might be victim of his group violence. Once, one of the biggest publishing companies in Indonesia, after knowing that one of their books are being protested by FPI because they think it's insulting Islam, immediately recalled the book and burnt all the stocks publicly, in the fear of bigger protest by FPI.

In this context, it becomes interesting to see the existence of Anda Bertanya Habib Rizieq Menjawab (HRM) Facebook Fan page, making fun of this person with status updates and also with pictures uploaded, because it is not often to see people voices their disagreement with FPI using this humorous way. It is also important to note that social media have become more important in Indonesia. In 2014,

there are around 79.2 million social media users or around 94.8% of the internet users in Indonesia. Facebook seems to be the favorite with 64 million users, making Indonesia the fourth biggest Facebook country. With almost 30 million users, Indonesia is the country with the biggest growth in terms of Twitter users. Until this paper was written, there are around 90 thousand followers, making HRM one of the biggest religious affiliated fan pages in Indonesia. To put it in perspective, the followers of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU)' Facebook Fan page, the biggest Islam organization in Indonesia, is around 37 thousands.

The approach used by HRM is similar with several other political satires found in several studies. Perhaps one of the most famous examples for the recent study for satire can be found in Egypt, especially after the Arab Spring. Leila (2012) shows that the this region has the long history of using of literature, art, and humor as tools of political protest, and the Arab Spring has encouraged more mature comedic art forms and the Arab Spring has encouraged humor while also offering new and inventive ways of mocking social and political structures and reclaiming and re-appropriating civic discourse, as demonstrated by Syrian viral art campaign.

A political satire program "Al-Bernameg" (The Program) in Egypt has created massive discussion in the media related to the level of acceptance of Egyptians to this new format and its effects on the audience (El Gabry, 2014). The study found that the program has a major influence on the audience regarding their perception of the political situation; however, it does not affect their political engagement or participation. Viewers in Egypt perceive the program as an entertainment show, yet they also consider it as a source of news and become affected by its presentation of the political situation (El Gabry, 2014).

Another study shows that satire gives the opportunity for an alternative view about

some recent issues. Remediating news in this way is not only funny, but it also offers viewers alternative ways to think about the news they view in the mainstream media. According to Elliott Gaines, the "narrative continuity constructed from rebroadcasts of news stories, told with the intent to entertain, ironically informs the audience of the significance of events whose meanings are obscured in conventional broadcast journalism" (2007: 81-96). Furthermore Petersen (2011) shows that in Egypt, social media has already emerged to a significant extent as a space for critical commentary on the media. And as McCue (2009) noted, by employing irony these news satires provide a social critique of people and institutional power.

This research seeks to examine the messages that are communicated to the HRM Facebook Fan page followers and how they are constructed as a satire to persuade the followers to resist their radical idea and affirm to more moderate views. In shorts, the purpose of this study is to explore how Facebook posts such as text, image, video, and link on HRM Facebook Fan page frames Habieb Rizieq and his group's view as a satire.

In order to do that, a theoretical framework is needed to understand the purpose. This can be found in the Griffin's Theory of Satire (1994). Borrowed originally from literature study, the theory of satire provides a useful base for understanding the value and its literary method of execution. In this study, the intention is to see how HRM persuade its followers to move to the more moderate views rather than the radical views of Islam, through the literary method of execution, which is making fun or ridicule the views of Rizieq Shihab and its group .

To understand how HRM uses satire to fulfill its goal, it is appropriate to see it in the context of online de-radicalization, a way of countering the violent narratives offered by the original Habib Rizieq of FPI. Therefore,

this study will also look at the importance of counter narrative by Omar Ashour (2010). The methodology used to examine HRM is Rhetorical Analysis, focusing on Sonja Foss's (2004) metaphor approach to rhetorical criticism.

This study hopes to give some contribution, no matter how small it is in the field of Rhetorical theories, especially in looking toward social media usage in providing a tool for people to speak up their mind when it is hard to do so in the real life. Because social media like this is still new, and there are still a lot of opportunities and areas to explore for rhetorical theorists. As Zemmels (2006) noted that the rise of internet and communication practices that emerge within that context poses many challenges to scholarship, including the traditional rethorical practice. According to Zemmels, (2006) there are at least three general areas that challenge the rhetorical tradition: redefining the text for analysis, the changing nature of the audience, the indeterminacy of authorship. This study, which explores the usage of text (in this case text in the broader meaning: including status update, photo, video, and link), hopes to contribute to the first area: redefining the text for analysis. Also this study hopes to contribute on the insight of the civil society in post-Soeharto era, especially in this technological-savvy generation.

### Literature Review

Several key concepts used in this research will be discussed in here. It includes theories of satire, concepts of rhetoric, the idea of counter-narrative as a tool of de-radicalization, and the historical context of Indonesian religious intolerances. This will be discussed and constructed as a main framework for this study. This is done in order to understand the context of what HRM Facebook Fan page are trying to address in their posts.

### Theory of Satire

Since HRM Facebook Fan page position itself as a parody and satirical site. It is important to discuss the concept of satire itself in order to have a better understanding toward their messages. There will be several issues in satire discussed in here and will be used in this study. First of all, like many other concepts, having a definitive definition of satire will never be an easy thing. No wonder, as Griffin (1994) stated, "most satiric theory, at least since the Renaissance, is polemical, ranging itself against some previous practice or claim and attempting to displace it." (p. 6) But nonetheless, it is will be very helpful examine how scholars see satires.

Firstly, if we trace its etymology, many scholars believe that satire derived from Latin *satura*, *satira*, perhaps from *sature* or dish of mixed ingredients (Webb, 1912; Ullman, 1913; Marshall 2013; Knight, 2004). It is also interesting to mention here, that some people used to connect satire with satyrs, the half man-half beast, suggesting that satire is lawless, wild, and threatening (Griffin, 1994). Although it will make an interesting interpretation, this understanding is believed to be a literacy mistake popularized in the Renaissance era, when it was used to justify the rude, spirited, and defamatory character of satire (Knight, 2004).

But why do people use satire that involves humor? What differentiate satire with other forms of communications? Perhaps, this stems from the reason that humor is supporting the purpose of criticizing the subject. According to Ziv (1988), there are at least three functions of humor that is most relevant. First is aggressive function. This is where satire usually always ridicules or makes fun of the object and in same time, allowing the non-victim to have a feeling of superiority. Second,

the social function that can serve to reinforce intra and inter groups bonds, strengthening the cohesiveness of interpersonal relations. Third, the intellectual function in which it is based on absurdities, word play and nonsense, provides pleasure in "the temporary freedom from strict rules and rationality" (Ziv, 1988 as quoted in Simpson, 1988: 3). In this sense, it is important to remember that these three functions are done simultaneously and satire simply cannot readily be assigned with a single discourse function. This what make satire stands out compare to other type of humour such as "racist humor" where it can be said that only the aggressive function dominates (Davies 1988), or "absurdist humor" where the intellectual function dominates (Simpson, 1988)

From the discussion above, we can see that satire plays quite unique role in communication. Satire is a conversation where the satirist and satire are invited to discuss the satirized. Mostly the conversation is involving a way to question or critique the satirized, whereas humor are employed to help speak out the conversation that sometime hard to do in a normal way. In this light, it helped to see more clearly what HRM Facebook Fan page want to do with their satirical post.

#### Four Modes of Satire

In previous part, we already discussed the broader concept of satire and how it related with this study. Furthermore, there are still question left to be address specifically. If satire is used to criticize an object, what exactly is the level that it works? Griffin (2004) suggests that in order to arrive at a fuller understanding of the way satire works, we need to think about it as a rhetoric of inquiry, a rhetoric of provocation, a rhetoric of display, a rhetoric of play.

The first two indicate satire as having a specific purpose or an "end". First, satire as Inquiry sees that satire is an "exploratory

attempt to arrive at truth. Here, that satirist not only begins with a clearly articulated intention but executes that intention by mean of a fiction precisely designed to accomplish its predetermined purpose". Griffin, 1994: 52). Second, Satire as Provocation is a critique of false understanding. In this sense, the satirist raises questions; in provocation, whereas the question is designed to expose or demolish a foolish certainty. According to P.K Elkin (1973 as cited in Griffin, 1994: 52), in this context, satire is "a catalytic agent rather than an arm of the law or an instrument of correction: its function is less to judge people for their follies and vices rather than to challenge their attitudes and opinion, to taunt and provoke them into doubt, and perhaps into disbelief."

The last two, is a reminder that although satire is inquiry and provocation; and it shares a boundary not with polemical rhetoric, but with philosophical writing; it is important to be reminded that if we focus only on the way satire explores a moral problem or presses against our complacency, we run the risk of overemphasizing its moral intensity. For Griffin (2004), it is important to think of much satire as a kind of rhetorical performance or rhetorical contest: as display and play. Or in other words, as a "mean"

In this sense, Griffin stressed that as a performance, satire is designed to win the admiration and applause of a reading audience not for the ardor or acuteness of its moral concern but for the brilliant wit and force of the satirist as rhetorician. It has a sense of playfulness also. For Griffin (1994) this means that we can look at satire itself as a kind of play in several distinct but related senses: a play with moral ideas, play of irony and fantasy, or even a real people.

In summary, when it comes to the definition of satire, there are two concepts that stand out. First, it includes mocking or making fun of some object. Second, it is usually done with

purpose, such as influencing people or changing, or at least criticizing something.

### **Introduction to Front Pembela Islam (FPI) and HRM Facebook Fan Page**

As already mentioned in the pretext, the focus of this research is the HRM Facebook Page that satirized the real person, Rizieq Shihab, the leader of FPI. In this sub-chapter, I will explore the history of FPI from its forming until present time.

FPI is deemed as an Indonesian domestic organization responsible for numerous attacks on Ahmadiyah Muslims and others it deems religiously, socially or sexually deviant since its founding in 1998. Its motto is "Live Honorably or Die as a Martyr." It is known for violent, though generally non-lethal, attacks on those it deems "deviant others" and for ransacking night clubs, bars, massage parlors and other establishments promoting what it considers to be immoral activities, especially during the Muslim fasting month of Ramadan (Woodward et al., 2012). FPI actions have yielded few fatalities but many victims have been severely injured by blows from machetes and subjected to savage beatings with metal pipes or bamboo poles. When FPI are moving to attack their target it usually involve hundreds of young men. They also wore a distinctive white robes and turbans. Not only doing a large scale sweeping, sometime they also move in a smaller groups, confront, verbally and occasionally physically abuse young couples they suspect of engaging in immoral behaviors including being seen in public after dark. Moral and religious deviance, not the state or the world order, are the targets of the FPI's jihad (Woodward et al, 2012).

FPI's leaders, including founder Rizieq Siehab, the main actor to be satirized in HRM Facebook Fan page, and most of their followers come from traditional Indonesian Muslim backgrounds. Siehab is an Indonesian

of Hadrami (Yemini) descent. He is known at Habib Rizieq. Habib (beloved) is an honorific applied to Hadrami sayyid or descendants of the Prophet Muhammad. This lends an aura of sanctity to FPI, because many Indonesian Muslims revere Habib as sources of blessing and out of respect and admiration for the Prophet and his family. Most FPI supporters engage in modes of religious practice that Salafis and Wahhabis consider improper, such as visiting holy graves. Many are members of Sufi mystical brotherhoods. FPI pengajian (religious gatherings) typically include shalawat (songs praising the Prophet Muhammad and his family) accompanied by drums and tambourines that are an anathema to Wahhabis. (Woodward, 2012).

After introducing about FPI, the following part will try to introduce the satirical Facebook Fan page: HRM. Arguably, HRM Facebook Fan page is the first fan page of its kind that uses satire as the ways to promote its message (Lakshmi, 2012). This satirical fan page was first introduced in August 2012. According to its administrator, this site is maintained by five young people with ages from 26 to 29. They first build this site as a answer toward Front Pembela Islam, a hardline Islamic organization that often used violence and intimidation to push forward their conservative view toward others. Humor and satirical approach are selected because they see there are already exist some initiative from government or NGO to address FPI, so they want to offer a new way.

In just a month after it launched, this site attract around 7000 people to like their site. According to the admin, the policy for their Facebook posts is giving a message that has a lot of humor and visual satire to promote the religious harmony (Lakshmi, 2012). The existence of HRM Facebook Fan page drew some praise, including from Abdul Mu'ti, a secretary in Muhammadiyah, the second largest Islamic organization in Indonesia. Ac-

According to Mu'ti (2012) there are at least two positive impact of HRM Facebook Fan page. First, it shows that people do not like what FPI has done, and they used a unique way to show it. Second, it also shows that FPI is not something to be fear of. FPI exist, but they are not something extraordinary. Now days, after less than 2 years, HRM Facebook Fan page has been followed by more than 90 thousands people (2014), making it one of the most followed religious affiliated fan page in Facebook.

#### **Four Intervention Points in Internet Platform**

Moving to the four points of interventions, Shetret (2011) suggest that there are four area that we can used internet platform, in this context, also including HRM Facebook Fan page. First, weaken cult personalities The counterterrorism community has been somewhat helpless in confronting so-called bridge figures—extremist ideologues, theorists, and scholars who are extremely charismatic, ambitious, and prolific and yet advocate the use of violence. States have been very active in shutting down Web sites and forums, only to have them pop up under a new name and new server a little while later. Instead of shutting them down, damaging a personality's credibility and credentials as well as challenging their leadership role may be more effective in the long run.

Second, is to challenge the extremist doctrine. As mentioned above, the Internet often is used to spread and reinforce particular ideas, worldviews, and violently radical messages or narratives. It is important to amplify non extremist voices from the grassroots through expanded yet targeted online content development and dissemination, increased access to the Internet by civil society groups, and use of graphic visuals and multimedia to support persuasive language.

Third, dispel the glory of the "terrorist lifestyle". Radical clerics and ideologues often glamorize and aggrandize the life of activists and martyrs and ignore the real-world lack of romance associated with this role. In these online communications, a special emphasis must be placed on highlighting the inglorious nature of a terrorist's life and daily separation from family and undisputedly denouncing the concept of martyrdom and use of violence for political ends.

Fourth, offer a street-smart and locally developed and communicated counter narrative. A counter narrative, like the narrative it is trying to oppose, should offer a beginning, middle, and end and a purpose and be constructed as a social approach that educates and empowers communities. It should specifically appeal to those who are currently feeling alienated and marginalize and offer a beginning, middle, and end action and analysis of data and intelligence. Moreover, a counter narrative should establish or reestablish credibility and must be consistent with other actions taken by states, organizations, militaries, and legislatures and the foreign and domestic policies they promote. There is little current focus on the potential role of a counter narrative in "promoting psychological dis-engagement.

#### **Methodology**

##### **Preliminary Observations**

Several studies had been done on the area of satire. There are many ways to study satire. Mehrez (2013), for example, see that satire has a long history used as a strategy to speak out something when the circumstance is hard to speak directly. Goodall, H., Cheong, P., Fleischer, K., & Corman, S., (2012) study on humor communication also shows the same things, where satire has been used throughout history. A more recent look into the contemporary satire also can be seen in the writing

of Leila (2012), where we can find many examples in Middle East, where the tradition of using satire as a political protest flourished. More specifically, some study has used Griffin (1994) approach when examining a religious satire. For example Clanton (2007) showed that in his study of a graphic novel about Christianity, that there several layers of rhetoric are used when people are trying to portray a religious leader, in this case Jesus, in a more satirical ways. There are similarity with the condition faced by HRM Facebook Fan page when they try to apply satirical approach to portray a religious leader, in this case Habib Rizieq, to criticize his narrative about religion. This happened also in the situation where it is hard to criticize in him in the real life. Following the steps of previous steps, question that rise as the basis of this study: how does the HRM Facebook Fan page constructed its status update, images, videos, and links, through their Facebook posts, as a satirical message to provide a counter narrative against religious intolerances?

As already mentioned before, the Rhetorical Analysis is deployed as the methodology to explore the HRM Facebook Fan page. Historically, in the beginning, rhetorical analysis has a more limited use. It is usually only available to examine the discourses and textual artifacts that constituted public culture, such as those created by media and government institutions from a formalist critique perspective (Lindlof & Taylor, 2000). But later, especially in the more modern era, several rhetorical scholars such as Burke (1969) and Foss (2004) have broadened this approach to include sites of cultural narration and invention (including websites) and they place greater emphasis on "knowledge of the cultural members who add value to the creation of the above sites" (Lindlof & Taylor, 2002). Rhetorical analysis is therefore concerned with the "critical "paradigm of research and focuses on the study of relationships among power, knowledge and

discourse that are produced in situations of historical and cultural struggle" (Lindlof & Taylor, 2011).

More specifically, as used in this research, we will focused more on Foss's approaches to rhetorical analysis of text – metaphor analysis and narrative analysis. Foss (2004) defined metaphor as "non-literal comparisons in which a word a phrase from one domain of experience is applied to another domain". A metaphor joins two terms normally regarded as belonging to different classes of experience. These two parts of the metaphor are termed as the "tenor" and the "vehicle" Foss (2004). The tenor "is the topic or subject that is being explained; the vehicle is the mechanism through which the topic is viewed" (Foss, 2004). Foss establishes metaphor as being "a major way in which we constitute reality". By organizing reality in particular ways, selected metaphors can also affect the way people act because they "contain implicit assumptions, points of view and evaluations" (Foss, 2004). In other words, metaphor is another way of knowing and experiencing the world at large.

This research study will follow Foss's approach using metaphor analysis, which involves the following steps:

Because the method is developed by Foss to be used in a traditional medium such as a paper, speech, and else, some adaptation are required for HRM Facebook Fan page because the medium is a social media. Several other studies have done this and they will serve as a basic framework for developing a more specific method for the purpose of this study. For example, Wyatt (2010) develops a five-part rhetorical framework to operate the rhetorical analysis in the context of Facebook post.

To do this approach, we need to ask rhetorical questions in five areas, which is the purpose, the writers, the audience, the treatment of subject, and the context. Some revi-



sion are needed because this study is limited to answer the big question of how the satirical message in HRM is constructed, so it is not necessary to ask all the five areas, so this study will limit itself in the writer and context questions. Therefore, for this study, framework has been adjusted to be use on studying the HRM Facebook Fan page posts. The steps are:

1. Describing the posts (text, image, video, or link)
2. Giving the historical context
3. Looking through the Tenor and Vehicle
4. Looking for possible metaphor
5. Analyzing image and text using 4 mode of satire and intervention points
6. Relating back and forth with the previous and next posts

### Sampling Procedure

The procedure to arrive at collecting final samples was composed by several steps. First, the HRM Facebook Fan page status updates and image uploaded is examined from 2012 to mid 2014. In order to have a relevant sample with the topic, first pre-eliminatory reading was executed to differentiate between the posts that have a relationship with religious extremism matter and those that have nothing to do with it. The next step is to categorize that posts into several categories that help us to examine the case of religious intolerances.

In the following section, the first thing to do is to do a mapping of all the relevant HRM Facebook Fan page posts. Because the

number of posts will be very massive, this study will limited itself in one events that is chosen because it is seen as appropriate to represent the major events in the case of religious extremism in Indonesia. These three events are chosen because they represent the newest major issues that happened in religious tolerances in Indonesia. By major issues is that this event took a lot of attention in mass media and religious discourse in Indonesia during that time. In this opportunity, this study will focus on the intra-religion intolerances which is taken from the case of schism between Sunni and Shiite Muslim in Sampang, Madura, that happened in August 2012

After limiting the events, the artifacts analyze will be presented in a form of screen shoots. Having all the screen shoots as the artifacts, the following step would be grouping each of them into the similar category. This is done to see the patterns.

After the sampling procedure, there are four screen shoots collected for this study. It is important to note that for each event, the range of Facebook post that is examined is +/- 7 days. The details for all the artifacts collected will be explained below. First is the schism between the Sunni and Shiite Muslim in Sampang, Madura in August 2012. For this event, after doing a pre-eliminatory studies, there are 4 artifacts that are posted by HRM Facebook Fan Page that have a relevancy with this case. From those 4 posts, it is consisted of 2 status updates (texts), 1 photo uploaded (images), and 1 link to a news articles.

**Tables 2** Artifacts Collected From HRM Facebook Fan Page (2012-2014)

	Sunni/Shiite
<b>Text</b>	2
<b>Video</b>	0
<b>Photo</b>	1
<b>Link</b>	1
<b>TOTAL</b>	4

## Analysis and Discussion

As already mentioned in the previous chapter, the method of analysis in this study will rely heavily on Sonja Foss's (2004) approaches to rhetorical analysis, which is the metaphor approach. Because of the nature of the medium of this study, which is Facebook as a social media, there are at least four textual artifacts that are going to be explored: text, images, video, and link that are shared by the Habieb Rizieq Menjawab Facebook Fan Page.

Furthermore, because this research is trying to see how this HRM Facebook Fan page construct their message using the four mode of satire and the relationship with the effort of providing a counter-narrative measure for online extremism, using four points of intervention, it is seen that the use of Foss's metaphor approach are appropriate for this kind of analysis.

## Shiite and Sunni Conflict in Sampang, Madura

Before moving into the metaphor analysis for this event, I will give a brief recap for this method. First of all, according to Foss, there are two parts of a metaphor. The first part is called "tenor" while the second part is called "vehicle" (Foss, 2004). When put together, this two parts form what Foss called "a system of commonplaces." In order to create a fully worked metaphor, there has to be an interaction between these two parts. This

interactions happened when the characteristic associated with the vehicle are used to organize the conceptions of tenor.

But what exactly is tenor and vehicle? For Foss, the so-called "tenor" is the topic or subject that is being explained. For example, in this research study, especially in this particular event of Shiite and Sunni Conflict in Sampang, Madura, the subject that is being explained is the counter-narrative for the radical viewpoint of religion, provided by the HRM Facebook Fan page through their satirical message.

Meanwhile, the "vehicle" itself is define as the mechanism or lens trough which the topic is viewed, which in this case of study, is the Facebook posts provided by HRM Facebook Fan page. To be more specific, not merely a posts but a symbols that form parts of the Facebook posts on the HRM Facebook Fan page, that are being subjected to be analyzed to ascertain what kind of insight they could offer to this research study. By symbols, what this study means is a various forms in the context of the medium itself (Facebook). Therefore the symbols mean the four types of posts in Facebook: 1) text, 2) image, 3) video, 4) link. This mean that the rhetoric itself is not limited to just a written and spoken discourse but also includes a non-discursive or non-verbal symbols as well as discursive and verbal symbols (Foss, 2004 as quoted in Kalinowski, 2013).



Figure 1 Sunni and Shiite Image 1

On this specific issue, HRM Facebook Fan page, posted only one image (Figure 1). The tenor is the acceptance of Shiite as a part of Islamic tradition that has been going without problem. The vehicle is the mashed up image of two person which is Mahmud Ahmadinejad, the previous president of Iran and the leader of FPI which the Habib Rizieq himself. There are a total of four panel of this two persons, mashed up together in a juxtaposed ways like a comic, so the reader must read all the four panel from the upper left to right and so on. This image generates a fair number of like and share, which is 193 likes and 56 shares, drawing 55 comments from the readers.

In the first panel, there are texts, whereas Ahmadinejad is saying that under his leadership Iran is becoming developed, dare to against United States of America openly, and being able to have its own nuclear technology. This followed by the second panel, where Habib Rizieq is show by his face only, briefly smiling in a somewhat shy way. And the third panel, back to Ahmadinejad, with the text "what did you do to the Shiite followers in Indonesia," and the final panel showed that Habib Rizieq giving a kind of face expression that showing a fear and a hopelessness and fear of reprising Ahmadinejad's statement.

The choice of using Ahmadinejad images might be the metaphor of the courageous and righteousness that can come despite of what sect of Islam that someone chose, whether is Shiite or Sunni. This is done by showing the list of what Ahmadinejad, a Shiite, have done that give a resonant in Indonesian's Sunni majority, such as the stand to defy USA, which often considered as the enemy of Islam and also the ability to develop a nuclear power, seen as both a symbol of defiance against USA and symbol of Islam's ability in the terms of technology, which often considered slow in adopting and creating a technologies

By using Ahmadinejad as the met-

aphor of courageous and righteous Islamic leader, possibly a reflection of the significance given to him, as an appealing image for potential reader of HRM Facebook Fan page. It is no brainer that Ahmadinejad admired by many Muslim in Indonesia especially because the image of Ahmadinejad's low profile lifestyle is very popular to be shared and circulated among Indonesian Muslims.

Meanwhile, in both panel of Habib Rizieq, there's no texts at all, and only showing a face of a person who cannot argue with the argument given by Ahmadinejad. This suggested that the problem of Shiite and Sunni is actually an argument that has no strong support to be continued.

Therefore, we can regarded the whole images as a metaphors for the situation that should really happened: there's no reason for fighting between this two sects and the reader, in this case specifically the Sunni as the majority, should be able to accept Shiite, because Shiite also means Islam and you can also be a good Muslim like Ahmadinejad while you're a Shiite.

At the same time, to re-enforce this metaphor, HRM Facebook Fan page, again repeat the similar message, but now using two status updates (Figure 2). The message is similar, invoking the golden age of Islam under the Persian empire, which is dominated by Shiite Islam. In the second status updates, again the courageous and righteous metaphor are evoked once more, this time by showing off again the resilient of Iran to resist again the pressure of United States of America. Both of this status updates gain a similar number of likes and comments, with the first status gained 149 likes and 64 comments, whereas the second status updated gained 124 likes and 56 comments.

The last posts that are given by the HRM Facebook Fan page on the issues of Sunni-Shiite conflict in Sampang, Madura, was a link with the title of "Anti Bigotry Lec-



Figure 2 Sunni and Shiite Text 1 & 2

ture.” This link directed the reader into a notes authored by Viya Rani.

The note itself is a quite long articles, dealing with the history of Shiite sects since it inception in early 7 century AD. The article tried to answer two important questions: first, the political dimension of Shiite sect and second the doctrinal dimensions, especially about the coming of Iman Mahdi, a kind of savior in Islam narrative, and trying to show that Shiite actually a quietist rather than activist in doctrinal area.

After looking all the posts by HRM Facebook Fan page on these issues, I will try to cross examined the approach with the four method of satire and the four points of intervention. Before that, another brief recap for Griffin’s four mode of satire, where he treats satire as containing rhetoric of inquiry, rhetoric of provocation, rhetoric of display and rhetoric of play.

The rhetoric of inquiry deals with how the satirist writes in order to explore and clarify a topic through satiric discourse. This discourse lends itself particularly well to open-ended inquiry, as opposed to a steady

progress towards conclusion. Opposite to inquiry is provocation. While inquiry attempts to arrive at one precise truth by means of exploration, satiric provocation takes a more negative approach; in this case, the satirist critiques false understanding. Provocation and inquiry both raise questions, but expect different outcomes. The goal of provocation is to expose or demolish a foolish certainty. Inquiry and provocation border on philosophical and ethical writing by exploring moral problems, however, satire also works as a form of rhetorical performance or contest in the form of display and play.

The rhetoric of display is much like a public performance. Much of the intention behind it is to gain the interest and admiration of the audience by employing wit. If the one, garners the attention of someone on such basis, it is easier to convince them that your opinions are the right ones. Rhetoric of play is also part of this performance; it deals with how the satirist is able to play on other genres and texts by various means, such as alluding to text outside itself, and other intruding genres and voices.

Examining the posts through this lens, it can be said that on this issues, HRM Facebook Fan page, explore more on the mode of rhetoric of provocation on all of his text-based post and a rhetoric of provocation and play in the image uploaded. The rhetoric of inquiry is used one time in the notes.

This we can see by the number of posts HRM Facebook Fan page use to discuss this issues. From 4 posts, 3 posts contain only a text and a note, while 1 post even though it is in the form of image also deal with a significant number of text. It is important to notes that all of the posts in this issue happened on the same day, which is 29 August 2012. From this, it's seem that HRM Facebook Fan page took the issues quite serious so they posts four time to address the issues. Not only that, they used almost all mode of satire to address it, this can be considered a very holistic approach, using all means that they can get: inquiry, provocation, and play.

This perhaps stems from the nature of the issues itself. A differences of Sunni and Shiite Islam is quite fundamental and also has been around for decade, it is somewhat doctrinal and also a political one. The bottom-line is, this is a very serious issue in history of Islam, and therefore it is also needs a more comprehensive approach to handle. That's why many of HRM Facebook Fan page on this issues deal with a text, as a way to explore and discuss the differences from both side, also the image.

And in the sense of four interventions to give a counter-narrative, on this issue, HRM Facebook Fan page deals more with challenging the extremist doctrine that stated that Shiite is not a real Muslim. This can be seen from the way HRM Facebook Fan page evoking Iran's President, Mahmoud Ahmadinejad, and also the succeed story of Iran in the context of Islamic world. By doing this, HRM Facebook Fan page is trying to challenge from the extremist that claim that Shiite is not a real

Islam. And in the same time, they represent Habib Rizieq in a mocking way, making them to weaken the cult personality.

The table below helped to summarize my finding for this section. In the first column, the L/C/S is abbreviation for Like, Comment, and Share, that hopefully will be helpful for the future study.

## Conclusion

This chapter attempts to review all the parts that are done in this study, to give some conclusion and also suggestion for the future study.

First thing to note, this kind of study is perhaps the first in the context of Indonesian religious intolerance. Many study before are focusing on the more mainstream media such as newspapers, magazines, or television. Also, the subjects of research also contained in these media, such as the news sections, the editorial pages, or weekly cartoon. The study of new media and social media, in this case: with the intersection of religious intolerance and also satire as the way to approach this problem is arguably a new thing. Therefore, there are still many limitations on this study that hopefully can be done better in the near future.

Habib Rizieq Facebook Fan Page (HRM) is arguably the first kind of this Facebook Fan page that is making a satire as the way it approach the religious problem in Indonesia. Therefore, although it s influence might be small compare to more mainstream media, this Facebook Fan page give an unique opportunity to see how the initiative to address the increasingly important religious problem in Indonesia.

In looking at this HRM Facebook Fan page, I borrow the idea of Four Mode of Satire by Griffin (2004) and also triangulate it with the way of counter narrative for radicalization in online media by Shetret (2011). In order to see how HRM Facebook Fan page fitted and

constructed its message (either text, photo, video, or link, as the possible ways to post in Facebook) toward this two base theory, I used the methodology of Rhetorical Analysis from Sonja Foss (2011) as my primary tool.

In the course of my studies, some modification and tweak are needed since all this theory and methodology are not originally used to Facebook medium. For example, I didn't focus much on Sonja Foss distinction of tenor and vehicle itself or per se, but rather, I used them as the way to look the message from HRM Facebook Fan Page in the terms of mode of satire and intervention points. Another point will be the intervention of online radicalization itself, since the fourth point mentioned by Shetret (2011) is judged irrelevant for the study, so it was omitted from the study.

Based on my analysis of four posts from HRM Facebook Fan page on three big issues in religious problem in Indonesia which is the Sunni versus Shiite issue, Non-Muslim leadership, and also Christmas greetings, there are several conclusion that emerge.

### **Rely Heavily on Rhetoric of Provocation**

After conducting the research, it is confirmed that this hypotheses is true. First, on the pattern of how its constructed its message, it is obvious and also confirm to several previous perception about the way satire works. As the satire sites, HRM Facebook Fan page rely mostly on the rhetoric of provocation. It used this mode three out of four times, it is important to note again that off course each post is not always as rigid as this, for that some degree and spectrum were. Therefore this table and number is more like a spectrum and a broad mapping of the mode of satire that are used by HRM Facebook Fan page. Heavy reliance on the rhetoric of provocation suggests that HRM Facebook Fan page is consistent with its vision and mission as the satire site, not

merely an information or news site, or even a strict doctrinal site.

### **More Effort In the Doctrinal Side**

After conducting the study, it is found that this hypothesis is found invalid in the case of HRM Facebook Fan page. Although HRM Facebook Fan page done a lot of thing to ridicule the person, like most satire, but the challenge they give is directed more into the doctrinal things. But in this sense, it's important to note that this also will be an interesting topic for further research starting point, with more sample to be considered.

### **Fluid and Dynamic Presentation**

Beside of the main hypotheses, several thing can also concluded from this study. The way HRM Facebook Fan page constructed its message also can said very interesting. It is fluid and dynamic, not static one. Depending on the issues, it can swiftly switch its approach on constructing its message. For example, when the situation is new and quite serious where ner. But when the situation is less serious, they will not hesitate to used it to mock or purely provoke the competing side and only make fun of it, like we can see in the case some group were attacked (like in the case of Sunni versus Shiite) they knew when to be serious by posting a message that deal more with text and persuasion in calm man of Rhoma Irama in the non-Muslim leader issues. This shows that even it is a satire site, and perhaps some see it only as a fun way, the HRM Facebook Fan page actually quite sophisticated in constructing its message.

### **Context-Awareness**

But why do the HRM Facebook Fan page can be so liquid and dynamic when presenting its message? One of the reasons that emerge from the study is this Facebook Fan page is actually very aware of its context,

in this sense is the Indonesian historical, political, and religious context. This will be a very interesting part for further study, but the pattern that emerged from the analysis, suggested that they have a good understanding of the field that they are one. This helps them to maneuver it message through different issues without much problem. They are also good in using another resources, like aggregating the posts from its follower.

### Limitation and Future Developments

As already mentioned above, this kind of study of Facebook satirical fan page that deal with religious problem in Indonesia is perhaps a very new one, where there are not many study done before. Therefore there are some limitations in this study.

First of all, the limitation of the literature reviews on this subject. Whereas the research on the issues of satire is quite extensive, it is not the case with satirical Facebook Fan page, especially in Indonesian context. Facebook page like HRM is quite a new phenomenon in Indonesia, so it is hard to find a suitable one. Therefore, it is acknowledge that this study, also in its analysis which more to explanatory rather than interpretive, is yet to reach a level of in-depth research. Nonetheless, it is hoped that this study can give contribution for the future study in this subjects.

Therefore, there's many possibility for further development. For example, the number of interactions such as comments, likes, and shares is a very interesting point to study the effects of the message, since this study is limited in how the message was constructed. For the future study, using more samples will also be very available option where these issues can be examined by more perspectives. In the course of times, it is interesting also to note that HRM Facebook Fan page spurs a rising of several other Facebook Fan page that dealing with various issues, but using the

same approach: parodying or satirizing people or issues through Facebook Fan page. Thus, again, the study of effect is a very open opportunity for further study.

\*\*\*

### Reference

- Ashour, O. (2011). Online De-Radicalization? Countering Violent Extremist Narratives: Message, Messenger and Media Strategy. *Perspectives on Terrorism*, 4(6).
- Aquina, D (2013). Hina Presiden, Demokrat Minta Polisi Tangkap dan Bubarkan FPI. *Vivanews*. Retrieved from <http://us.politik.news.viva.co.id/news/read/431380-hina-presiden--demokrat-minta-polisi-tangkap-dan-bubarkan-fpi> (Accessed 20 March 2014)
- Baum, M. A. (2003). *Soft news goes to war: Public opinion and American foreign policy in the new media age*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University.
- Brummett, B. (2006). *Rhetoric in popular culture*. Sage
- Burke, K. (1969). *A rhetoric of motives* (Vol. 111). Univ of California Press.
- Clanton, D. (2007). Scriptural Education and Entertainment: Evangelism, Didacticism, and Satire in Graphic Novels. *SBL Forum*. Retrieved from <http://www.sbl-site.org/publications/article.aspx?ArticleId=704> (Accessed, 17 March 2014)
- Dalene, A. (2012). *Satire's Corrective Function: Jon Stewart and Post-Modern, Generative Satire*.
- Elkin, P. K., & Elkin, P. K. (1973). *The Augustan defense of satire*. Clarendon Press.
- Foss, S.K. (2004). *Rhetorical criticism: Exploration and practice*. Waveland Press.
- Goodall, H., Cheong, P., Fleischer, K.,

- & Corman, S. (2012). Rhetorical Charms: The Promise and Pitfalls of Humor and Ridicule as Strategies to Counter Extremist Narratives. *Perspectives On Terrorism*, 6(1). Retrieved from <http://www.terrorismanalysts.com/pt/index.php/pot/article/view/goodall-et-al-rhetorical/365>
- Griffin, D. H. (1994). *Satire: A critical rein-troduction*. University Press of Kentucky.
- Hamluddin. (2013) Rizieq Syihab Calon Presiden 2014. *Tempo*. Retrieved from <http://www.tempo.co/read/news/2013/08/23/078506798/Rizieq-Syihab-Calon-Presiden-2014> (Accessed 17 March 2014)
- Harris, R. (1990). The purpose and method of satire. *Virtual Salt*, 1-11.
- Hasibuan, S. (2012). The Act of Killing. *Al Jazeera*. Retrieved from <http://www.aljazeera.com/programmes/101east/2012/12/2012121874846805636.html> (Accessed 18 March 2014)
- Harsono, A. (2013). *In Religion's Name: Abuses Against Religious Minorities in Indonesia*. Jakarta. Human Right Watch
- Kalinowski, A. F. (2013). *Come Live the Good Life: A Rhetorical Examination of the Persuasive Techniques on the New Zealand Immigration Service Website* (unpublished master's thesis) Auckland University of Technology
- Knight, C. A. (2004). *The literature of satire*. Cambridge University Press.
- Lakshmi, P. (2012). Facebook page promotes peace through parody. *Khabar South-eastAsia*. Retrieved from [http://khabarsoutheastasia.com/en\\_GB/articles/apwi/articles/features/2012/07/16/feature-07](http://khabarsoutheastasia.com/en_GB/articles/apwi/articles/features/2012/07/16/feature-07) (Accessed 14 march 2014)
- Leach, J. (2000). *Rhetorical Analysis*. MW Bauer & G. Gaskell (Eds.) *Qualitative researching with text, image and sound: A practical handbook* (pp. 207-226).
- Leila. (2012) Satire and Political Protest in Saudi Arabia. *Muftah*. Retrieved from <http://muftah.org/satire-and-political-protest-in-saudi-arabia/#.U7etSlb-5neK> (Accessed 15 March 2014)
- Lindlof, T. Taylor (2010) *Qualitative Communication Research Methods*.
- Love, H. (2004). *English clandestine satire, 1660-1702*. Oxford University Press
- Menchik, J. (2014). Productive Intolerances: Godly Nationalism in Indonesia. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 56(3), 591-621.
- Mehrez, Samia (2013). The Importance of Being Bassem: Political Satire and Revolution in Egypt. Retrieved from <http://www.hf.uio.no/ikos/english/research/projects/gulf/events/the-importance-of-being-bassem%3A-political-satire-a.html> (Accessed 17 March 2014)
- Nu Online (2008). Cukup Banser dan Garda Bangsa yang Hadapi Habib Riziq. *NU Online*. Retrieved from <http://www.nu.or.id/a,public-m,dinamic-s,-detail-ids,1-id,12603-lang,id-,FK-B++Cukup-+Banser+dan+Garda+Bangsa+yang+Hadapi+Habib+Riziq-.phpx> (Accessed 17 March 2014)
- Peterson, M. A. (2011). Egypt's media ecology in a time of revolution. *Arab media & society*, 14.
- Pew Reseach (2008). Journalism, Satire or Just Laughs? "The Daily Show with Jon Stewart," Examined. Retrieved from <http://www.journalism.org/2008/05/08/journalism-satire-or-just-laughs-the-daily-show-with-jon-stewart-examined/>
- Purnell, N (2014). Facebook Users in Indonesia Rise to 69 Million. *Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <https://loglr>



- com/i/83054 (Accessed 23 March 2014)
- Rogers, B (2013). *Indonesia: Pluralism in Peril The Rise of Religious Intolerance Across the Archipelago*. Christian Solidarity Worldwide, Oxford.
- Setara Institute. (2013). *Stagnasi Paripurna Kondisi Kebebasan Beragama/Berkeyakinan di Indonesia 2013*. Jakarta.
- Simpson, P. (2003). *On the discourse of satire: Towards a stylistic model of satirical humor (Vol. 2)*. John Benjamins Publishing.
- Shetret, L. (2011). *Use of the Internet for Counter-Terrorist Purposes*. Center on Global Counterterrorism Cooperation (Feb 2011) [http://www.globalct.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/02/LS\\_policybrief\\_119.Pdf](http://www.globalct.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/02/LS_policybrief_119.Pdf) (Accessed 11 March 2014)
- The Pew Global Attitudes Project (2008). *Unfavorable Views of Jews and Muslims on the Increase in Europe*. Washington, DC. Pew Research Center.
- Thrall, W. F., Hibbard, A., & Holman, C. H. (1960). *A handbook to literature* (p. 418). New York: Odyssey Press.
- U.S. Department of State (2012). *International Religious Freedom Report, 2012* Washington, DC: US. Department of State.
- Wahid Institute. (2012). *Laporan Akhir Tahun Kebebasan Beragama dan Intoleransi 2012*. Jakarta
- Woodward, M., Yahya, M., Rohmaniyah, I., Coleman, D. M., Lundry, C., & Amin, A. (2013). *The Islamic Defenders Front: Demonization, Violence and the State in Indonesia*. *Contemporary Islam*, 1-19.
- Woodward, M., Yahya, M., Rohmaniyah, I., Coleman, D. M., Lundry, C., & Amin, A (2012). *Hate Speech and The Indonesian Islamic Defenders Front*. Center for Strategic Communication